

HIV Prevention Materials in Asian & Pacific Islander Languages: A Summary of Review Panel Findings

**Bengali / Cambodian / Chinese / Gujarati / Hindi / Hmong / Japanese
Korean / Lao / Samoan / Tagalog / Thai / Urdu / Vietnamese**

August 1999

By Prescott Chow and Ignatius Bau
Asian & Pacific Islander American Health Forum
450 Sutter St., Suite 600
San Francisco, CA 94108

Funded by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
Cooperative Agreement U22/CCU 909841-05

Table of Contents

Background Information	3
Summary	3
Findings	4
Review Process	5
National Review Panel Members	6
Gaps Identified	8
Recommendations	10
Next Steps	13
Attachments	14
• Best Materials	
• List of Materials Reviewed	

This report is dedicated to Cathy Taito, a colleague in American Samoa and a member of the Samoan review panel who passed away this year.

Background Information

The Asian & Pacific Islander American Health Forum (APIAHF) is a national organization dedicated to promoting policy, program, and research efforts for the improvement of health status of all Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders. APIAHF achieves these goals through policy analysis, research, information dissemination, and community capacity building activities. One such community capacity building program is the HIV/AIDS-focused Empowerment Through Training and Technical Assistance (ETTA) Program. This program offers programmatic and organizational capacity building to AIDS service organizations, social service agencies, community based organizations and health departments that are doing HIV interventions targeting Asians and Pacific Islanders.

Summary

During the past four years, the ETTA Program has convened national panels to review existing HIV prevention materials in Asian & Pacific Islander languages. The main objective of the reviews was to examine materials in terms of information and translation accuracy. Members of the review panels were asked to recommend brochures that were appropriate to specific target populations and to identify gaps in HIV prevention materials for each language reviewed. The panels also developed a language-specific glossary of common HIV/AIDS terminology. Finally, each panel developed concepts for new materials based on a priority gap they identified.

In 1996, national review panels were convened for Chinese, Tagalog and Vietnamese materials. In 1997, national review panels were convened for Korean, Cambodian and Japanese materials. In 1998, national review panels were convened for Thai, Hmong, Lao and Samoan materials. This year, national review panels were convened for Bengali, Gujarati, Hindi and Urdu.

The panels reviewed 12 Bengali materials, 19 Cambodian materials, 39 Chinese materials, 12 Gujarati materials, 16 Hindi materials, 4 Hmong materials, 21 Japanese materials, 17 Korean materials, 13 Lao materials, 7 Samoan materials, 18 Tagalog materials, 13 Thai materials, 13 Urdu materials and 29 Vietnamese materials. A total of 233 materials have been reviewed by the 14 national review panels. Materials were identified and collected through a variety of channels. AIDS service organizations, community based organizations and health departments that target Asians and Pacific Islanders in their HIV prevention programs were queried on the materials they provided clients. Samples were collected from these agencies or from the referred sources. Solicitations for HIV prevention materials were also announced to the National Asian & Pacific Islander Consortium on AIDS and STDs network through newsletter mailings and electronic mailing list postings. Materials were also cross-checked with the National AIDS Clearinghouse. Most of the materials were from U.S. agencies; however, we did include several pieces originating in Asia, the Pacific Islands, Europe and Canada.

Panel members were a diverse group of people (in respect to gender, sexual orientation, class, geography, etc). Panelists were chosen for their ability to represent their communities. Most panel members had some HIV prevention background (as staff or as a volunteer). Panel members had to be able to speak, read, and write in the language of the materials that they were reviewing, as well as in English. Panel members were identified through referrals from community based organizations and the National Asian & Pacific Islander Consortium on AIDS and STDs. A total of 62 panel members participated in the reviews from over 35 community based organizations, academic institutions and health departments.

Findings

Translation Issues

1. There was a noticeable difference in the quality of brochures originally written in the targeted language and brochures developed in English and then translated into these languages.
2. There were many poor translations from an original English text (e.g. errors in translation, poor translations that failed to convey the original intended message).
3. While many of the brochures contained a listing of resources and referrals, a majority of the listings were in English.
4. Some of the brochures were too general to be useful for specific target populations.

Content Issues

5. Many of the materials were outdated, referring to archaic terminology (e.g. ARC). Also, most pieces failed to mention new treatment options for individuals living with HIV.
6. Some of the materials perpetuated, rather than dispelled, misconceptions about HIV/AIDS (e.g. AIDS as a "foreigner's disease, or HIV as a disease must be "hidden" from friends or co-workers).
7. The actual HIV prevention message differed widely among the brochures, from messages of strict abstinence from all sexual activity to more "sex-positive" messages. Very few brochures included instructions on proper condom use as a means of protection against HIV infection.
8. Inappropriate language (e.g. homophobic and judgmental) was used in some brochures.

Cultural Appropriateness

9. Most brochures need more appropriate and relevant graphics. Most of the brochures used generic "oriental" motifs that were not appropriate for our cultures. Other materials had little or no graphics and therefore were unappealing or uninteresting.
10. Too many materials were written brochures; this does not take into consideration the oral communication traditions of some of the cultures (e.g. Samoan and Hmong).
11. Literacy level – many brochures are too clinical and do not work for the communities.
12. While materials coming from countries of origin were accurate in terminology, they weren't always relevant for Asian & Pacific Islander communities here in the U.S.

Gaps Identified

13. Most of the brochures reviewed targeted the general population; therefore the information conveyed was general and basic.
14. Though most brochures reviewed were for general population audiences, few encouraged family discussions or viewed HIV prevention as a community responsibility.
15. Gaps identified: more targeted brochures to specific at-risk subpopulations (gay/bisexual men and other MSM, youth, IDUs, women and transgenders).
16. Youth materials were not always appropriate and did not speak to the bicultural nature of their lives.
17. Cofactors to high risk behaviors were also identified as important topics to address (e.g. drug and alcohol use, self esteem issues, racial and sexual orientation identity issues).
18. Tattooing as a risk factor is rarely dealt with in HIV prevention materials, though it is a common practice in some Asian and Pacific Islander communities.

Other Issues

19. Many review panels were disappointed in the lack of materials available in their languages.
20. Review panel members from HIV prevention programs noted the lack of funds to create and distribute up-to-date and accurate materials. Many materials were not typeset and printed but handwritten and photocopied. This made them hard to read and unappealing.

Review Process

Panelists were sent language-specific materials to be reviewed before the actual in-person meeting. In preparing for the two-day review, panelists were asked to review each material and note translation and content accuracy and cultural appropriateness. Panelists were also given an English glossary of common HIV/AIDS terminology to translate into the given language.

At the meeting, panelists first discussed their initial comments on the individual materials. The panel then catalogued the materials by targeted populations: General Community; Gay/Bisexual/Other Men Who Have Sex With Men; Women At Risk, Youth At Risk, Injection Drug Users, Transgenders, etc. Panels discussed more fully each material and documented their collective comments. After all the materials were reviewed, the panel made their recommendation list of "best materials" for each targeted population. In some cases, several materials were highly rated for a population and were all recommended. However, in more instances, there were few or no materials available for review for specific populations (e.g. Women or IDUs) and therefore the recommended list was short.

After reviewing this recommended materials list and also utilizing their own expertise with the population, the panel discussed and documented the gaps in current HIV prevention materials. Using their list of gaps in materials, the panel then prioritized a couple of targeted populations and began the development of materials for those populations.

Panels realized this was a first step in any new materials to be developed (participants recognized the need for focus groups and product testing as necessary steps among others) but valued the chance to work with other service providers to develop initial concepts for language (and culture) specific HIV prevention materials.

The findings, recommendations and potential materials development concepts were then incorporated into this final report. Additionally, participants stressed the need to utilize this information for any future materials development project.

Each panel also developed a language-specific glossary of common HIV/AIDS terms. This glossary was developed as a tool for service providers so appropriate and/or accurate terminology will be used when explaining HIV/AIDS related issues with clients or the communities. The glossary can also be used in the development of any new materials.

National Review Panel Members

<p>Chinese March 1996 Oakland, CA</p>	<p>Li Ma / <i>Asian and Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / New York, NY</i> Ghee Phua / <i>Asian Health Services / Oakland, CA</i> Leng Lim / <i>Asian Pacific AIDS Intervention Team / Los Angeles, CA</i> Paul Chan / <i>Asian & Pacific Islander American Health Forum / San Francisco, CA</i></p>
<p>Tagalog March 1996 San Francisco, CA</p>	<p>Ludy Resurreccion / <i>Asian and Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / New York, NY</i> Welmin Militante / <i>Asian Health Services / Oakland, CA</i> Epee Rafanan / <i>San Francisco AIDS Foundation / San Francisco, CA</i> Mara Torres / <i>Asian AIDS Project / San Francisco, CA</i> Victor Hall / <i>Filipino Task Force on AIDS / San Francisco, CA</i> Rene Astudillo / <i>Asian & Pacific Islander American Health Forum / San Francisco, CA</i></p>
<p>Vietnamese March 1996 San Francisco, CA</p>	<p>Quynh Tran / <i>Indochinese Community Center/Washington, DC</i> Tru Vu / <i>Asian Pacific AIDS Intervention Team/Los Angeles, CA</i> Tony Nguyen / <i>Center for Southeast Asian Refugee Resettlement / San Francisco, CA</i> Lon Pham / <i>Choices Project, University of Washington / Seattle, WA</i></p>
<p>Korean April 1997 Los Angeles, CA</p>	<p>David Kim, MD / <i>Saint Vincent's Hospital and Medical Center; Board member, Asian and Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / New York, NY</i> Hye-Kyung Kang, MA / <i>Asian Counseling & Referral Services / Seattle, WA</i> Namshik Jonah Park / <i>Asian Pacific AIDS Intervention Team / Los Angeles, CA</i> Doo-Hyung Choi / <i>Los Angeles, CA</i></p>
<p>Cambodian May 1997 San Francisco, CA</p>	<p>Yonn Leoung / <i>Cambodian Community of Greater Fall River, Inc / Fall River, MA</i> Samnang Chea / <i>ROCA Revere Project / Revere, MA</i> Sam Ath Eat / <i>Saint Anthony's Medical Center, Chinatown Child Development Center / San Francisco, CA</i> Sopheap Kaing / <i>International District Health Center / Seattle, WA</i></p>
<p>Japanese May 1997 Los Angeles, CA</p>	<p>Megumi Baba / <i>Life Foundation / Honolulu, HI</i> Ippei Yasuda / <i>Asian & Pacific Islander Wellness Center / San Francisco, CA</i> Naoki Onizuka / <i>Japanese American AIDS Project, Japanese Community Youth Center / San Francisco, CA</i> Hiromi Tanaka / <i>Asian Pacific AIDS Council / Seattle, WA</i> Masami Kobayashi / <i>University of California, San Francisco / San Francisco, CA</i></p>

Thai April 1998 San Francisco, CA	Srisakul (Susie) Kliks / <i>University of California Universitywide AIDS Research Program / San Francisco, CA</i> Pissanu (Paul) Pantutamangkul / <i>Thai Community Development Center / Los Angeles, CA</i> Dao (Dawn) Passar / <i>Asian & Pacific Islander Wellness Center / San Francisco, CA</i> Charon (Timmy) Promlack / <i>Asian & Pacific Islander Wellness Center / San Francisco, CA</i> Waraporn (Nid) Tiaprasith / <i>Pacific Asian Language Services / Los Angeles, CA</i> Paweena Theinpeng / <i>Asian Pacific Health Care Venture / Los Angeles, CA</i> Nirun Thitirakpanit / <i>Asian Pacific AIDS Intervention Team / Los Angeles, CA</i> Vansit (Sonny) Vajrabukka / <i>Search to Involve Pilipino Americans / Los Angeles, CA</i>
Hmong April 1998 Philadelphia, PA	Chong Moua / <i>Lao Family Community of Minnesota / St. Paul, MN</i> Kou Moua / <i>Bi Valley Medical Center / Sacramento, CA</i> Richard Yang / <i>California Health Collaborative / Fresno, CA</i> Heulang Chu Yang Heu / <i>Lao Family Community of Minnesota / St. Paul, MN</i>
Lao April 1998 Philadelphia, PA	Eddie Chacon / <i>AIDS Services In Asian Communities / Philadelphia, PA</i> Thongpane Thepvongsa / <i>Indochinese Community Center / Washington, DC</i> Nokeo (Jackie) Muongchanh / <i>Asian Pacific AIDS Council / Seattle, WA</i> Chava Lee / <i>Lao Family Community of Milwaukee / Milwaukee, WI</i>
Samoan June 1998 Honolulu, HI	Merina Sapolu / <i>Kokua Kalihi Valley Comprehensive Family Services / Honolulu, HI</i> Timena Brown / <i>Honolulu, HI</i> Cathy Taito / <i>Department of Public Health / American Samoa</i> Toeutu Fa'a leava / <i>San Francisco, CA</i> Dan McMullin / <i>Laguna Niguel, CA</i> Victor Liu / <i>Asian Pacific Health Care Venture / Los Angeles, CA</i>
Bengali February 1999 New York, NY	Debanuj Dasgupta / <i>Naz Foundation / Akron, OH</i> Mohammed Mollah / <i>Asian and Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / New York, NY</i> Sandip Roy-Chowdury / <i>Trikone / San Francisco, CA</i> Fayaz Rushd / <i>AIDS Services in Asian Communities / Philadelphia, PA</i>

Gujarati February 1999 New York, NY	Shaffiq Essajee / <i>New York, NY</i> Ahmed Lokhat / <i>Alliance for South Asian AIDS Prevention / Toronto, Ontario CANADA</i> Dewan Pardiwala / <i>Pacific Asian Language Services / Los Angeles, CA</i> Dharmesh Pardiwala / <i>Pacific Asian Language Services / Los Angeles, CA</i>
Hindi February 1999 New York, NY	Javid Syed / <i>Asian and Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / New York, NY</i> Sidharth Verma / <i>Asian and Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / New York, NY</i>

Urdu February 1999 New York, NY	Abid Faraz Ahmed / <i>Asian and Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / New York, NY</i> Mubbashir Rizui / <i>Asian and Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / New York, NY</i> Zavare Tengra / <i>Alliance for South Asian AIDS Prevention / Toronto, Ontario CANADA</i>
--	--

Gaps Identified

	Languages						
	Chinese	Tagalog	Vietnamese	Korean	Cambodian	Japanese	Thai
Sub-populations							
Women At Risk	X	X		Pregnant women	(including women's repro. health issues)	(including women's repro. health issues)	X
Lesbian, Bisexual			X	X	X		
Youth At Risk	X	X	Gang kids	X		(including queer & questioning youth)	X
Gay, Bisexual and other MSM			X	Non-gay identified MSM	X		X
Injection Drug Users	X	X		X	X	X	X
Trans-gender	X	X					X
Commercial sex workers			X	X			
Lower Literacy					X	X	
General community						Male customers of commercial sex workers	(including mother & child, straight men, blue collar workers)

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Chinese materials reviewed by the Chinese panel: *women, youth, injection drug users and transgenders*.

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Tagalog materials reviewed by the Tagalog panel: *women, youth, injection drug users and transgenders*.

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Vietnamese materials reviewed by the Vietnamese panel: *gay/lesbian/bisexual, commercial sex workers and gang kids/at-risk youth*.

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Korean materials reviewed by the Korean panel: *non-gay identified Korean men who have sex with men, commercial sex workers, pregnant women, lesbians, youth and injection drug users*. Additionally, the following were topic areas prioritized by the Korean panel: *addressing issues of monogamous individuals whose partners*

engage in unsafe sexual behavior (e.g. how Korean women can negotiate for safer sex with partners) and "non-threatening" materials for general community (e.g. brochure covers that don't contain the word "AIDS" or "HIV").

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Cambodian materials reviewed but prioritized by the Cambodian panel: *lower literacy, gay/lesbian/bisexual, women (including women's reproductive health issues), youth and "needle users"*.

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Japanese materials reviewed but prioritized by the Japanese panel: *youth, including gay/lesbian/bisexual questioning youth, injection drug users (both active users and those experimenting), women (including women's reproductive health issues), lower literacy and male customers of commercial sex workers (both men and women)*. Additionally, the following were topic areas prioritized by the Japanese panel: *behavior change, myths and misconceptions about HIV/AIDS, Japanese language services/resources nationwide, Negotiation skills for both men and women, Interracial/cultural and linguistic issues, Immigration and AIDS information included in general STD brochures/materials to reach clinic and hospital patients*.

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Thai materials reviewed but prioritized by the Thai panel: *women, transgender, blue collar workers (restaurants, factories), youth, injection drug users, men (gay, bisexual, straight, etc) and mother & child*.

Sub-populations	Languages					
	Lao	Hmong	Samoan	Bengali	Gujarati	Urdu
Women At Risk			X		X	
Lesbian, Bisexual				X		
Youth At Risk	X	X	X	X	X	X
Gay, Bisexual and other MSM	X	X	(including fa'a fafine)	X	X	X
Injection Drug Users				X		X
Transgender						
Commercial sex workers				X		X
Lower Literacy			X			
General community		Adult men		Parents, community leaders, PWHA		

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Lao materials reviewed but prioritized by the Lao panel: *youth and gay/bisexual men, men who have sex with men*. Additionally, the following were topic areas prioritized by the Lao panel: *HIV antibody testing, compassion for HIV+ and PWAs and how to use a condom demonstration*.

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Hmong materials reviewed but prioritized by the Hmong panel: *gay/bisexual men, men who have sex with men, adult men and youth*. Additionally, the following were topic areas prioritized by the Hmong panel: *abstinence, relapse, oral and anal sex, drug and alcohol use, multiple partners (for youth, men), risky behavior (unprotected sex), support for HIV + and their families and self-esteem*.

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Samoan materials reviewed but prioritized by the Samoan panel: *youth, gay/bisexual men, men who have sex with men, fa'a fafine, women and low literacy level*. Additionally, though specific topic areas were not prioritized by the Samoan panel, some other suggestions included: *culturally specific Samoan materials (e.g. illustrations, terms), formatted for a culture that relies on oral communication over written, more inclusive of youth and materials should be more colloquial and humorous but accurate*.

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Bengali materials reviewed but prioritized by the Bengali panel: *locally targeted MSM material (e.g. issues of safer sex negotiation in MSM sex in the U.S.), youth (middle / high school), injection drug users, commercial sex workers, parents / community leaders, lesbians and persons with HIV/AIDS*. Additionally, the following were topic areas prioritized by the Bengali panel: *locally targeted MSM material (eg issues of safer sex negotiation in MSM sex in the U.S.), bilingual material targeted at allowing parents (who might be only comfortable in Bengali) and children (bilingual) to discuss issues with their family and the issues of immigration and the undocumented population – fear of authorities are all issues relevant to people here. Most available materials are from South Asia and do not address U.S. immigration issues*.

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Gujarati materials reviewed but prioritized by the Gujarati panel: *youth, bisexual men / married men who have sex with men and women*. Additionally, the following were topic areas prioritized by the Gujarati panel: *a brochure which is bilingual for parents and children to read together (simple, non-explicit to encourage a better dialogue of HIV etc. maybe a videotape in Gujarai with English subtitles), to educate MSM to better understand risks of infection and preventing transmission to family and empowerment of women, starting with the access to information*.

The following were sub-populations not currently or adequately targeted in any of the Urdu materials reviewed but prioritized by the Urdu panel: *youth, bisexuals, drug users and commercial sex workers*. Additionally, the following were topic areas prioritized by the Gujarati panel: *positive affirmation of sexual identity (tolerance, etc)*.

Recommendations

There were several critical findings and recommendations made by all the review panels.

Finding: There was a noticeable difference in the quality of materials written in the Asian and Pacific Islander languages and materials developed first in English and then translated into one of the Asian and Pacific Islander languages.

Recommendation: There was a strong and consistent recommendation to use focus groups convened from the target population to develop an original text for any future materials.

Finding: The review panels found an alarming number of errors in translation as well as typographical and proofreading errors. There were many poor translations from original English text (e.g. errors in translation, poor translations that failed to convey the original intended message).

Recommendation: These errors highlight the need for careful translation and proofreading. All the panelists also noted the need for consistent terms to be used in HIV prevention materials. The Asian and

Pacific Islander language glossaries of common terms used in HIV prevention developed by each of the review panels should assist in establishing more consistency across new materials and programs. Some panels agreed that in some instances, it is very difficult to find literal translations of many English terms, especially medical terms and those that deal with sex. At least five of the panels suggested using the English term in those instances.

Finding: While many of the brochures contained a listing of resources and referrals, a majority of the listings were in English.

Recommendation: Panels felt that agencies (especially the description of their services) should be listed in the Asian or Pacific Islander language as well. Panels also recommended that listings should indicate the language capacity of the agency.

Finding: Some of the brochures were too general to be useful for specific target subpopulations.

Recommendation: Panels recommended that translations should be more relevant to, and adapted to specific target subpopulations (eg the brochure titled, "API Women and AIDS" should instead read "Korean Women and AIDS". Many immigrants identify by ethnicity (i.e. Vietnamese or Lao), not by racial category (i.e. Asian & Pacific Islander).

Finding: There were very few current materials available. Many of the brochures were outdated, using old terms (eg ARC) or failed to mention new treatment options for individuals living with HIV. As well, some of the materials carried old, outdated notions about the disease and promoted, rather than dispelled, misconceptions about HIV/AIDS (e.g. AIDS as a "foreigner's disease, or HIV as a disease must be "hidden" from friends or co-workers).

Recommendation: Panelists agreed that more current and accurate information needs to be available and accessible in Asian and Pacific Islander languages. Agencies should revise their materials on a regular basis. Panels also recommended brochures indicate the date of print to help the reader determine whether or not the information is current or up to date.

Finding: The actual prevention message differed widely among the materials, from messages of strict abstinence from all sexual activity to more "sex-positive" messages. Very few materials included instructions on proper condom use as a means of protection against HIV infection.

Recommendation: Communication between agencies producing these materials should encourage continued discussion on prevention approaches, information and messages. While standardization of the actual prevention messages may be difficult, panelists stated there needed to be some consistency in the information. Panel feedback to each agency on their reviewed material should also help this process.

Finding: There were very few or no HIV prevention education materials targeting women, youth, IDUs or transgender persons. Most of the brochures targeted the general Asian and Pacific Islander communities and may be ineffective in reaching these groups.

Recommendation: Panels recommended producing HIV prevention materials targeting these subpopulations. While there is a continued need for general population materials, more effort and funds must be allocated for these at-risk populations. Community-based organizations have the expertise to work with these subpopulations to create appropriate materials but lack the funding to accomplish it. More dollars need to be identified to produce these materials.

Finding: While there were materials targeting gay/bisexual men and other MSM in some languages, this wasn't consistently true for all the languages. Also, some materials used homophobic and judgmental language.

Recommendation: There is a need for increased training around queer (i.e. gay/bisexual MSM, transgender, etc.) and alternatively employed (i.e. commercial sex workers) issues. Current materials need to be appropriately revised for these communities. Again, the recommendation for the use of focus groups convened from the target population to develop future materials should assist in the creation of more culturally competent materials. This should be implemented especially for languages that identified a gap in materials targeting that population.

Finding: The review panels found few graphics and illustrations in the materials that were culturally appropriate and relevant to targeted Asian and Pacific Islander populations. Though the review panels critiqued API language-specific materials, most of the brochures used generic "oriental" motifs that were not appropriate for those languages. Other materials had little or no graphics and therefore were unappealing or uninteresting.

Recommendation: Panels all recommended the use of ethnic-specific imagery, not a pan-API approach used in most of the materials. While agencies use this ploy to get "the most bang for their buck", panelists were insulted by the lack of cultural appropriateness sometimes shown. Asian cultures are not interchangeable. This is even more apparent between Asian and Pacific Islander communities. The use of focus groups to pilot test materials before they are printed should help identify some of these problems.

Finding: Many brochures had "too much information" and were too clinical.

Recommendation: Panels suggested use of sidebars with definitions of key terms, to help make the information more understandable, especially for lower-literacy populations.

Finding: Too many materials were written brochures; this does not take into consideration the oral communication traditions of some of the cultures.

Recommendation: It was recommended that more materials be formatted for Asian and Pacific Islander cultures (e.g. Samoan and Hmong) that rely more on oral rather than written communication. For example, Hmong language videos would be more appropriate to use than brochures, as Hmong is a relatively new written language. However, out of the four Hmong HIV prevention materials available, only one was a video. Another suggestion was more graphically-oriented brochures. Additionally, panels suggested that materials incorporate the norms of the community (e.g. South Asian and Samoan panels recommended that the use of humor, like comic book formats, would be appropriate to approach taboo subjects like HIV/AIDS).

Finding: Language-specific youth materials were not always appropriate and did not speak to the bicultural nature of their lives.

Recommendation: Materials targeting youth and young people should be in both the Asian and Pacific Islander language and English, as many youth are bilingual yet don't identify with HIV prevention materials targeting the mainstream youth population.

Finding: Most of the brochures reviewed targeted the general population; therefore the information conveyed was general and basic.

Recommendation: General community HIV prevention materials need to convey more than information. They need to help engage parents and their children in conversations about HIV/AIDS. They also need to view HIV prevention as a community responsibility. Some suggestions from panels include videos that are subtitled in English to encourage discussion in multi-lingual families (monolingual parents and their bilingual children) or materials that include cofactors like drug and alcohol use, self esteem issues, racial and sexual orientation identity issues. Other topics in the community, like tattooing as a risk factor, should

be addressed. Panels also recommended more data collection as a means to identify additional issues and support program planning.

Recommendation: Other cofactors were suggested as important issues to address with HIV/AIDS, such as immigration and fear of deportation. Again, convening focus groups from the target population to develop any future materials should assist in the identification of the relevant social, political, economic and health issues surrounding HIV/AIDS for that population.

Finding: Many review panels were disappointed in the lack of materials available in their languages. Other members noted the lack of funds to create and distribute up-to-date and accurate materials. Many materials were not typeset and printed but handwritten and photocopied. This made them hard to read and unappealing.

Recommendation: Community-based organizations have the capacity to create materials that are most appropriate and effective for their communities; however, such projects are costly and time-consuming and thereby prohibitive for these generally small organizations. A well-funded national collaborative effort to continue to develop and distribute appropriate Asian and Pacific Islander materials would be an effective strategy for all Asian and Pacific Islander communities to have access to current, appropriate and accurate information.

Next Steps

This final report will be disseminated to the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, AIDS service organizations, social service agencies, other community-based organizations and health departments. Agencies that originally produced the HIV prevention materials will be sent this report as well as the panel review of their material. APIAHF will also contact the agencies that originally produced the recommended "best" materials to check on their current availability and order information. This report, as well as recommendations from the individual panels, also will be available on the internet at the APIAHF website: www.apiahf.org.

APIAHF will work to develop a national strategy to develop and produce Asian and Pacific Islander language HIV prevention materials using the findings and recommendations of the review panels that can be available to all community-based organizations and health departments providing HIV prevention targeting Asians and Pacific Islanders.

Attachments - Best Materials

(This section of the Report is suppressed pending approval from the CDC)

List of Materials reviewed

CHINESE

1. "To Women" / Chinatown Health Clinic / 1994
2. "Women and AIDS" / Chinatown Health Clinic / 1987
3. "AIDS and Children" / Chinatown Health Clinic / 1988
4. ----- / Harvey Milk AIDS Education Fund / 1988
5. "AIDS and TB" / State of Hawai'i Department of Health / 1988
6. "Asians and AIDS" / Chinatown Health Clinic / 1994
7. ----- / Chinatown Health Clinic / 1994 (parent and child)
8. "Don't Gamble with Your Life" / Chinatown Health Clinic / 1995
9. "AIDS" / Chinatown Youth Center / undated
10. "What You Should Know About AIDS" / Chinatown Health Clinic / 1988
11. "AIDS: Questions and Answers" / Chinatown Health Clinic / 1988
12. "AIDS" / Chinatown Health Clinic / 1988
13. "Condoms, Safer Sex, and AIDS" / Chinatown Health Clinic / 1988
14. ----- / San Francisco AIDS Foundation / undated
15. "Drugs and AIDS" / State of Hawai'i Department of Health / 1988
16. ----- / Northeast Medical Services / undated
17. "AIDS and Your Pregnancy" / South Cove Community Health Center / undated
18. ----- / American Red Cross / 1987
19. ----- / United States Department of Health and Human Services / 1988
20. "Get the Facts" / unknown / undated
21. ----- / A Streetwise Comic Production / 1992 (comic book)
22. "Multi-lingual, Multi-cultural HIV/AIDS Booklet for Asian Pacific Islanders of Chicago / Asian American AIDS Foundation / 1995
23. ----- / Horizons / undated (purplish pamphlet with 2 bare butts on the cover)
24. "What is HIV?" / Los Angeles County Department of Health Services / undated
25. "Frequently Asked Questions About AIDS" / Asian Pacific Health Care Venture / 1994
26. "AIDS" / Asian AIDS Project / 1988
27. ----- / Asian AIDS Project / 1993 (red booklet with 3 Asian women)
28. ----- / State of Hawai'i Department of Health / date unknown
29. ----- / Asian & Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / undated (2 Asian males on the cover, fusia strip at the top)
30. "Teens: Things You Should Know" / Chinatown Health Clinic / 1994
31. "Asians and AIDS" / Intercultural Family Services, Inc. / undated
32. ----- / Asian American AIDS Foundation / undated (brochure with Asian faces looking off to one side)
33. "AIDS" / South Cove Community Health Center / undated
34. "In the Shadow of Love – A Teen AIDS Story" / South Cove Community Health Center / undated
35. "HIV+AIDS" / Health Education Authority / 1992
36. "AIDS is Everybody's Affair" / Chinese American Planning Council / undated
37. "Asians and AIDS" / Asian AIDS Council and People of Color Against AIDS Network / undated
38. ----- / San Francisco City Clinic / 1995 (a couple lying in bed; one passing the other a condom)
39. "AIDS" / Asian & Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / undated (young man holding a mallet in hand on the front cover)
40. "What You Should Know About Hemophilia" / National Hemophilia Foundation / undated
41. ----- / Multi-cultural Prevention Resource Center / undated (brochure with Asian family drawn)

TAGALOG

1. "VD! STD! Or WHAT?" / State of Hawai'i Department of Health / 1993
2. "Bigyan ng Wastong pangangalaga ang inyong sarili at ang mga mahal sa buhay" / Multicultural Prevention Resource Center / undated
3. "Asyano At Ang Sakit Na 'AIDS': Asians and AIDS, Tagalog" / Asian AIDS Council and People of Color Against AIDS Network / undated
4. "Pagtatalik: Wala bang panganib ito?" / San Francisco City Clinic / 1995
5. "Pagaralan natin Ang AIDS Nang Di Natin Ito Katakutan" translation: "Pilipinos Should Not Have to Fear AIDS, If We Learn What AIDS is Really About" / West Bay Pilipino AIDS Education Project / undated
6. "Mabyuti: The Essentials of Being Hot" / Asian Health Services / undated

7. "Multi-lingual, Multi-cultural HIV/AIDS Booklet for Asian Pacific Islanders of Chicago" / Asian American AIDS Foundation / 1995
8. "Asiano at AIDS: Ano ang mga Katoto-Hanan?" Asian American AIDS Foundation / undated
9. "Ano Ang AIDS?" translation: "What is AIDS?" / AIDS Project Los Angeles / undated
10. "Ang AIDS at ang Pilipino: Ligtas ba tayo?" / Asian AIDS Project / 1988
11. "Asyano At Ang Sakit Na 'AIDS': Asians and AIDS" / International District Community Health Center / undated
12. "Ang mga Pilipinong Amerikano at ang AIDS" / Multicultural Training Resource Center / undated
13. "Ang Ugnayan Sa Pagitan: 'AIDS' At Tisis Mahalaga para sa iyo, Basahin mo ito!!!!!" translation: "AIDS and TB" / State of Hawai'i Department of Health / 1988
14. "Ang 'Drugs' At Ang 'AIDS'" translation: "Drugs and AIDS" / State of Hawai'i Department of Health / 1988
15. "Ano Ang HIV?" translation: "What is HIV?" / Los Angeles County Department of Health Services / undated
16. "Mga Bagay Na Madalas Itanong Tungkol Sa AIDS" translation: "Frequently Asked Questions About AIDS" / Asian Pacific AIDS Intervention Team / 1994
17. "AIDS? Ano Ito? Hindi Ako? Ako ay bata pa, Malusog at Asian Pacific..." / Asian Pacific AIDS Awareness Project / undated
18. "Kapwa Lalake" / Asian & Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / undated
19. "Dapat Ba Akong Magpasuri" translation: "Should I Take the Test" / Asian Pacific Health Care Venture / 1992

VIETNAMESE

1. "In the Shadow of Love – A Teen AIDS Story" / South Cove Community Health Center / undated
2. "AIDS" / South Cove Community Health Center / 1988
3. ----- / Multicultural Prevention Resource Center and Asian AIDS Project of AARS / undated
4. "Frequently Asked Questions About AIDS" / Asian Pacific AIDS Education Project / 1994
5. "AIDS" / Union of Pan Asian Communities / 1993
6. "Ban Co Biet" / Indochinese Community Center / undated (comic book)
7. "AIDS" / Multicultural Prevention Resource Center / undated
8. ----- / Asian AIDS Project / undated (purple booklet with 3 Asian females: daughter, granddaughter, mother)
9. ----- / Department of Health and Human Services / 1991
10. "AIDS – Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome" / unknown / undated (photocopied white brochure, 8 pages)
11. "AIDS la gi?" / Planned Parenthood of San Joaquin Valley / 1988
12. "AIDS in Vietnamese" / Asian Health Project, T.H.E. CLINIC / 1987
13. "Asian and AIDS" / International District Community Health Center / undated
14. ----- / City Clinic STD Education Unit San Francisco Department of Public Health / 1995
15. "Nhưng Du Kien La Gi?" / Asian American AIDS Foundation / undated
16. "Lam Sao De Bao Ve Ban, Gia Dinh Ban, Va N

KOREAN

1. "Nahm-suhng dew-rewl weh-ha-yuh" / Asian & Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / undated
2. "Man-ee-nee ah-ra-ya-hahl AIDS sahnng-sheek" / Los Angeles County AIDS Programs / undated
3. "Jung-ji! AIDS chee-ryo-beeng-ja sa-gee-haeng-weh" / California AIDS...Task Force / undated
4. "AIDS guan-heh hewn-hee moon-weh-dweh-newn sa-hahng-dool" / Asian Pacific AIDS Education Project and Asian Pacific AIDS Intervention Team / revised 1994
5. "AIDS-wah gyul-haek sa-ee-weh yuhn-guan guan-geh-newn" / State of Hawai'i Department of Health, AIDS/STD Project / 1988
6. "Ma-yahk-gwa AIDS" / State of Hawai'i Department of Health, AIDS/STD Project / 1988
7. "Na-neun AIDS gum-sa-ruhl ba-da-ya ha-newn-ga?" / AIDS Project Los Angeles / 1993
8. "Gum-sa-ruhl ba-dewnk-hoo" / AIDS Project Los Angeles / 1992
9. "AIDS rahn?" / Asian Pacific AIDS Education Project / undated
10. "Suhng-byung! Suhng-juh-geen jub-choke-ew-row chun-pa-dweh-newn byung! Tow-newn moo-ut-eeen-ga?" / State of Hawai'i Department of Health, STD/AIDS Prevention Program / revised 1994
11. "AIDS byung" / Asian Health Services AIDS Project / undated
12. "Eel-gew-sheep-she-yo...hahn-gook-gyo-po-dew-rewl weh-heh joong-yo-hahn bo-gun-eh..." / Asian & Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / undated
13. "AIDS rah-goo? Moo-rah-goo? Hah-ha-go-newn guh-ree-ga mull-uh na-newn juhm-go, gun-gahng-ha-go, dohng-yahng-sa-rahm-ee-ya..." / UCLA / undated
14. "Ah-she-ahn gew-ree-go AIDS" / Asian AIDS Council and People of Color Against AIDS Network / undated
15. "Multi-lingual multi-cultural HIV/AIDS booklet for Asian/Pacific Islanders of Chicago" / Asian American AIDS Foundation / 1995 (pages 18-19)
16. "How to Use a Condom" / Asian Pacific AIDS Intervention Team / undated
17. "Asian and Pacific Islander Women and AIDS" / Asian & Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / undated

CAMBODIAN

1. "How to Use a Condom" / Center for Southeast Asian Refugee Resettlement / undated
2. "What You Should Know About AIDS" / Southeast Asian Assistance Center / undated
3. "Should I Take the Test?" / AIDS Project Los Angeles / 1992
4. "After Test" / AIDS Project Los Angeles / 1992
5. "Information for Persons Who Have Taken the HIV (AIDS) Antibody Test" / State of Hawai'i Department of Health, AIDS/STD Project / undated
6. "AIDS and TB" / State of Hawai'i Department of Health, AIDS/STD Project / 1988
7. "Tuberculosis, Sexually Transmitted Diseases & AIDS" / Southeast Asian AIDS Prevention Project / 1994
8. ---- / Center for Southeast Asian Refugee Resettlement / undated (yellow booklet with extended family)
9. "Asians & AIDS" / Asian AIDS Council and People of Color Against AIDS Network / undated
10. "Facts on AIDS" / AIDS Education and Prevention Program, Intercultural Family Services / undated
11. "What about AIDS" / Indochinese Community Center / 1990
12. ---- / Multicultural Prevention Resource Center / undated (black & white pamphlet with green text & drawings)
13. "What You Should Know About Hemophilia" / National Hemophilia Foundation / undated
14. "AIDS: The Virus That Doesn't Discriminate" / Iowa Department of Human Services / undated
15. "VD! STD! Or What?" / State of Hawai'i Department of Health, AIDS/STD Project / revised 1988
16. ---- / California AIDS...Task Force / undated (pamphlet with stop sign)
17. ---- / US Department of Health & Human Services, Publication #HHS-88-8404, 1991
18. ---- / Indochinese Community Center / undated (large blue booklet)
19. "Multi-lingual, Multi-cultural HIV/AIDS Booklet for Asian/Pacific Islanders of Chicago" / Asian American AIDS Foundation / 1995

JAPANESE

1. "AIDS" / Japanese Community Youth Council / undated
2. "AIDS" / Asian & Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / undated (green pamphlet with Japanese motifs)
3. "Gei no tame no AIDS no..." / Asian & Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / undated
4. "Tomare..." / California AIDS...Task Force / undated (pamphlet with stop sign)
5. "Anata no..." / Multicultural Prevention Resource Center / undated
6. "AIDS ni tsuite" / Asian Pacific Community Counseling / undated
7. "AIDS wa..." / Asian Pacific Community Counseling / undated
8. "Sekkus de..." / Hawai'i State Department of Health, STD/HIV Prevention Program / revised 1989
9. "AIDS in Japanese" / Asian Pacific AIDS Education Project / undated
10. "Frequently Asked Questions about AIDS" / Asian Pacific AIDS Education Project and Asian Pacific AIDS Intervention Team / revised 1994
11. "What is HIV?" / Los Angeles County Department of Health Services, AIDS Program Office / undated
12. "What People with HIV Infection Should Know about Their Rights in California" / Bioethics Committee and Los Angeles County Barristers ADIS Hospice Committee / undated
13. "Should I Take the Test?" / AIDS Project Los Angeles / 1992
14. "After Test" / AIDS Project Los Angeles / 1992
15. "How is AIDS Transmitted?" / AIDS Project Los Angeles / undated
16. "How to Use a Condom" / T.H.E. Clinic Asian Health Project / undated
17. "Sekkus: Anzen na no?" / City Clinic / 1995
18. "Safe Sex Comes in All Languages" / Gay Asian Pacific Alliance Community HIV Project / 1991 (postcard)
19. "Asian American Communities Against AIDS" / Asian American Communities Against AIDS / undated
20. "Multi-lingual, Multi-cultural HIV/AIDS Booklet for Asian/Pacific Islanders of Chicago" / Asian American AIDS Foundation / 1995
21. "Asians and AIDS" / Asian AIDS Council & People of Color Against AIDS Network / undated

THAI

1. Frequently Asked Questions About AIDS / *Asian Pacific AIDS Intervention Team / 1997*
2. Should I Take the Test? / *AIDS Project Los Angeles / 1992*
3. After the Test / *AIDS Project Los Angeles / 1992*
4. Information for Persons Who Have Taken the HIV Antibody Test / *State of Hawai'i Department of Health / date unknown*
5. Asians & AIDS: What's the Connection? / *Asian AIDS Project / 1990*
6. AIDS and TB / *State of Hawai'i Department of Health / date unknown*
7. Drugs and AIDS / *State of Hawai'i Department of Health / date unknown*
8. VD, STD, or What? / *State of Hawai'i Department of Health / 1988*
9. Comic book / *from Thailand / date unknown*
10. Stop AIDS / *Asian Pacific AIDS Intervention Team / date unknown*

11. Condom packet / *Asian AIDS Project* / date unknown
12. Comic book / *from Thailand* / date unknown
13. Safer sex card / *unknown origin* / date unknown

LAO

1. What About AIDS / *Indochinese Community Center* / 1990
2. HIV/STD Prevention Program for Hmong and Lao / *Lao Family Community of Minnesota* / date unknown
3. Information for Persons Who Have Taken the HIV Antibody Test / *State of Hawai'i Department of Health* / date unknown
4. Drugs and AIDS / *State of Hawai'i Department of Health* / 1988
5. AIDS and TB / *State of Hawai'i Department of Health* / 1988
6. AIDS: No One is Immune / *Union of Pan Asian Communities* / 1993
7. AIDS comic book / *Health and Welfare Canada* / date unknown
8. Asians & AIDS: What's the Connection? / *Asian AIDS Project* / 1990
9. Xxx / *City Clinic STD Education Unit, San Francisco Department of Public Health* / date unknown
10. VD, STD, or What? / *State of Hawai'i Department of Health* / 1988
11. Xxx / *Center for Southeast Asian Refugee Resettlement* / date unknown
12. What You Should Know About AIDS / *Southeast Asian Assistance Center* / date unknown
13. Behind the Mask: AIDS, It Affects All of Us / *Association of Asian Pacific Community Health Organizations* / 1989

HMONG

1. HIV/AIDS: Yog Dab Tsi? / *Asian Pacific AIDS Intervention Team* / date unknown
2. HIV/STD Prevention Program for Hmong and Lao / *Lao Family Community of Minnesota* / date unknown
3. What You Should Know About AIDS / *Southeast Asian Assistance Center* / date unknown
4. Behind the Mask: AIDS, It Affects All of Us / *Association of Asian Pacific Community Health Organizations* / 1989

SAMOAN

1. PA'U PUIPUI / *New Zealand Family Planning Association* / 1994
2. FA'AALIGA MO I LATOU UA FAIA A LATOU SU'EGA MO LE AIDS (Information for Persons Who Have Taken the HIV Antibody Test) / *State of Hawai'i Department of Health* / date unknown
3. O LE FESO'OTAIGA I LE VA O LE AIDS MA LE T.B. (AIDS and TB) / *State of Hawai'i Department of Health* / date unknown
4. VAILA'AU MA LE AIDS (Drugs and AIDS) / *State of Hawai'i Department of Health* / date unknown
5. Ma'i Afi! Po O Le A Tonu? (VD, STD, or What?) / *State of Hawai'i Department of Health* / 1988
6. AIDS / *Union of Pan Asian Communities* / 1992
7. Behind the Mask: AIDS, It Affects All of Us / *Association of Asian Pacific Community Health Organizations* / 1989

BENGALI

1. Condom Pack / *The Naz Foundation* / 1995
2. It's That Condom Moment / *The Naz Foundation* / 1996
3. HIV/AIDS Cartoon Booklet / *The Naz Foundation* / 1996
4. STDs : A Guide for MSM / *The Naz Foundation* / 1997
5. Hepatitis B - The Facts / *The Naz Foundation* / 1997
6. HIV & AIDS Information / *The Naz Foundation* / 1997
7. HIV - The Facts / *The Naz Foundation* / 1996
8. STDs for MSM / *The Naz Foundation* / 1997
9. What Every Woman Should Know / *The Naz Foundation* / 1995
10. STDs / *The Naz Foundation* / 1997
11. AIDS HIV The Facts / *APICHA* / date unknown
12. DIVA: Quarterly Journal of South Asian Women / *Alliance for South Asian AIDS Prevention* / date unknown

GURAJATI

1. Condom Pack / *The Naz Foundation* / 1995
2. It's That Condom Moment / *The Naz Foundation* / 1996
3. HIV/AIDS Cartoon Booklet / *The Naz Foundation* / 1996
4. STDs : A Guide for MSM / *The Naz Foundation* / 1997
5. Hepatitis B - The Facts / *The Naz Foundation* / 1997
6. HIV & AIDS Information / *The Naz Foundation* / 1997
7. HIV - The Facts / *The Naz Foundation* / 1996
8. STDs for MSM / *The Naz Foundation* / 1997
9. What Every Woman Should Know / *The Naz Foundation* / 1995
10. STDs / *The Naz Foundation* / 1997

11. *ADVICE / Alliance for South Asian AIDS Prevention / 1994*
12. *Brochure with designs / Alliance for South Asian AIDS Prevention / 1994*

HINDI

1. *AIDS (small square brochure) / Alliance for South Asian AIDS Prevention / date unknown*
2. *Brochure with men kissing / Asian & Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / date unknown*
3. *Brochure with designs / Alliance for South Asian AIDS Prevention / 1994*
4. *Brochure with group of men / Asian & Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / date unknown*
5. *ADVICE / Alliance for South Asian AIDS Prevention / 1994*
6. *DIVA: Quarterly Journal of South Asian Women / Alliance for South Asian AIDS Prevention / date unknown*
7. *Condom Pack / The Naz Foundation / 1995*
8. *It's That Condom Moment / The Naz Foundation / 1996*
9. *HIV/AIDS Cartoon Booklet / The Naz Foundation / 1996*
10. *STDs : A Guide for MSM / The Naz Foundation / 1997*
11. *Hepatitis B - The Facts / The Naz Foundation / 1997*
12. *HIV & AIDS Information / The Naz Foundation / 1997*
13. *HIV - The Facts / The Naz Foundation / 1996*
14. *STDs for MSM / The Naz Foundation / 1997*
15. *What Every Woman Should Know / The Naz Foundation / 1995*
16. *STDs / The Naz Foundation / 1996*

URDU

1. *AIDS (small square brochure) / Alliance for South Asian AIDS Prevention / date unknown*
2. *DIVA: Quarterly Journal of South Asian Women / Alliance for South Asian AIDS Prevention / date unknown*
3. *Condom Pack / The Naz Foundation / 1995*
4. *It's That Condom Moment / The Naz Foundation / 1997*
5. *HIV/AIDS Cartoon Booklet / The Naz Foundation / 1996*
6. *STDs : A Guide for MSM / The Naz Foundation / 1997*
7. *Hepatitis B - The Facts / The Naz Foundation / 1997*
8. *HIV & AIDS Information / The Naz Foundation / 1997*
9. *HIV - The Facts / The Naz Foundation / 1997*
10. *STDs for MSM / The Naz Foundation / 1997*
11. *What Every Woman Should Know / The Naz Foundation / 1995*
12. *STDs / The Naz Foundation / 1997*
13. *Men Together / Asian & Pacific Islander Coalition on HIV/AIDS / date unknown*